



Collaboration Governance in Realizing Balbar as an Independent Village in Kota Tidore Kepulauan

Isra Muksin¹, Mansyur Djamal²

^{1,2}**Universitas Bumi Hijrah Tidore, Indonesia**

Correspondent: isram23@unibrahtidore.ac.id¹

Received : December 1, 2024

Accepted : December 27, 2024

Published : January 31, 2025

Citation: Muksin, I., Djamal, M. (2024). Collaboration Governance in Realizing Balbar as an Independent Village in Kota Tidore Kepulauan. *Ilomata International Journal of Social Science*, 6(1), 48-64.

<https://doi.org/10.61194/ijss.v6i1.1619>

ABSTRACT: Balbar Village in Tidore Islands City is trying to realize itself as an independent village through a collaborative governance approach. This study aims to analyze how collaboration between the government, the community, the private sector, and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) can accelerate the achievement of village independence. This study uses a qualitative method with data collection through in-depth interviews, participatory observation, and documentation. The results of the study show that good governance collaboration can increase the efficiency of the independent village program, but there are several obstacles, such as low community participation and lack of financial literacy. To overcome these obstacles, it is necessary to improve communication between stakeholders and empower human resources (HR) in villages.

Keywords: Governance Collaboration, Independent Village, Tidore Islands, BUMDES, Community Empowerment



This is an open access article under the CC-BY 4.0 license

INTRODUCTION

Balbar Village, North Oba District, has been implementing collaborative governance since 2016. The implementation of collaborative governance by involving the private sector, the community, civil society and good civil society organizations will be determined by the government of Tidore City, Balbar Islands as an independent village in 2022. The village head realizes that building a village requires the partnership of various parties because the role of the village is very important, but the problems faced are very complex.

In accordance with the Village Government Performance Report (LKKPD) of Balbar Tidore Islands City during 2011-2015, the participation of actors in collaborative governance is still low as shown in the table in 1. Table. The level of community participation in collaborative governance.

Year	Participants			
	WHO	Private	Government	Community
2016	40%	35%	100%	41%
2015	25%	33%	100%	37%
2014	23%	25%	100%	37%
2013	24%		100%	37%
2012	15%		100%	30%

Source: LKKPD Balbar Village 2011-2015

In accordance with table 1. Table. The level of community participation in collaborative governance can illustrate that community participation is still low, especially the private sector has not contributed significantly to village independence, participation is quite high only in the government sector. This means that the governance of village government independence is still dominated by the local village government, when compared to other sectors ([Drucza, 2019](#); [Liu et al., 2022](#); [Wang & Yuan, 2021](#)).

Building an independent village must be collaborative. This means that villages as the front line in nation development, with complex problems and budget limitations and lack of human resources, require collaboration between actors because *Collaborative governance* Basically, it is a way of governance that directly involves stakeholders outside the government who are consensus-oriented and deliberative in the collective decision-making process, the goal of which is to make public policies and programs ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#); [Bae et al., 2016](#); [Margerum et al., 2019](#)).

Based on this, then, *Collaborative governance* as a model of control between one or more institutions to be involved together in the implementation of decisions that are based on consensus and even to the implementation of policies. Thus ([Ibrahim et al., 2020](#); [Noor et al., 2022](#); [Zeppel, 2012](#)) *collaboartiev governance* Anshall and Gash can be the basis for the government of Balbar Village, North Oba District, Tidore Islands City to meet the Developing Village Index (IDM). The Building Village Index (IDM) is a composite index formed from the Social Resilience Index (IKS), the Economic Resilience Index (IKE), and the Village Ecological Resilience Index.

The achievement of Balbar Village as an independent village, in practice through a *collaborative governance framework* supported by a high spirit of community mutual cooperation and transparent management of village government starting from planning, implementation and evaluation. In addition, Balbar Village is one of the inclusive villages so that it receives support from the North Maluku provincial government, especially the Department of Industry, Trade and SMEs, the Tourism Office, and the support of the Tidore Islands City government.

Conceptually, collaboration governance is still hotly debated and its international implementation is still experiencing obstacles and different approaches, including in Indonesia, even in village governments in Indonesia after 2016 ([Gustafsson & Scurrah, 2023](#); [Previtali & Salvati, 2021](#); [Thapa et al., 2022](#)). Therefore, in our opinion, building an independent village is important to be researched. However, the success of building Balbar Village into an independent village is

naturally supported by the support of the local community, not just forced from above. In accordance with our observations, *collaborative governance* has been effectively carried out by the Balbar Village government. This is what makes this research important because of the need for mapping and analysis related to the efforts and responses of the Balbar Village government to create an independent village initiated by the Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration.

There have been several studies related to *collaborative governance*, Among others: Analysis *Collaborative Governance* in the Development of Tourism Village Areas, ([Arma, 2023](#); [Gurvantry et al., 2022](#)) *Collaborative Governance* in Development *Smart Village* . *Collaborative Governance* ([Zakia & Wicaksono, 2023](#)) in Developing Rural Areas, . However, these studies have not clearly targeted the role of the government, the private sector, and civil society organizations. This is what becomes ([Febrian, 2016](#); [Satria & Letari, 2022](#)). Research Issues We are the extent to which the village government is involved in collaborating to build an independent village in the context of Tidore Islands City. The purpose of this research is to find out the role of the community in realizing Balbar as an independent village in Tidore Islands City.

METHOD

This research was conducted in Balbar Village, Oba District, Tidore Islands City using a qualitative approach with a case study method. Data was collected through interviews with 22 (twenty-two) informants consisting of 5 (five) people from the Balbar Village Government, North Oba District, 5 (five) people from the Berkah Village-Owned Enterprises (BUMDes), 3 (three) representatives from the private sector, and 5 (five) community members, and 4 (four) people from the Tidore Islands City Community Empowerment Office. Direct observation in the field and analysis of program documentation were also carried out.

The testing of the validity of the data in this study is based on certain criteria, namely the degree of trust and correctness of the data (*credibility*) obtained from informants who are directly involved in collaborative governance in making Balbar an independent village in Tidore Islands City. Truth (*correctness*) a description, conclusion, and explanation (*explanation*) which can be known from the conformity with laws and regulations and other important manuscripts/documents. The interviews were conducted openly with questions that focused on the role of each actor in the collaboration as well as the obstacles faced ([Creswell, 2018](#)).

This research procedure is carried out through several stages, namely: First, the pre-field stage, namely activities to prepare a research design, determine the location, manage permits, track or assess field conditions, determine informants, prepare research equipment and prepare the researcher to adapt to the research object. Second, data processing is carried out through processing and data processing is carried out by examining all available data from various sources (interviews, observations, studies/documents) then making an abstraction, namely making a summary of the core, processes and statements that are needed to be maintained so that they remain in it for the refinement of data recording. Second, by categorizing, namely compiling categories on the basis of choices, intuitions, opinions or certain criteria for the data obtained. Next, place the data in their respective categories. Third, the data analysis stage starts from the

moment they enter the field to conduct research. Data analysis is the process of compiling data so that it can be interpreted. Data compilation is done by classifying data into patterns, themes or categories so that it can give meaning to the analysis, explain patterns or categories and look for relationships between various concepts that reflect the researcher's perspective or view and not the truth.

To analyze the data, the process of arranging the order of the data is carried out, organizing it into a pattern, category and basic description unit. In this process, the data is simplified so that it is easier to read and interpret so that it is able to dig into more extensive, detailed, and in-depth information. Data in the form of words and not a series of numbers were collected through observations, interviews, documents and tapes ([Bryson et al., 2006](#); [Miles & Huberman, 1992](#)).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Governance Collaboration Process

This study analyzes the process *Collaborative Governance* by using a theory that emphasizes active participation, multistakeholder involvement, and joint decision-making. In this context, the stages of stakeholder involvement in the development of Balbar as an independent village in Tidore involve local governments, village communities, and external actors such as NGOs. Process ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)) *Collaborative Governance* describing the development of stages ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)). There are stages *collaborative governance*, that is; problem discovery, goal determination, and implementation. The governance collaboration in Balbar Village began in 2018, when the village government realized that the high poverty and unemployment rates were due to a shift from the characteristics of an agricultural village to a service village because Balbar Village is one of the villages located in the center of the capital city of North Maluku Province since 1999.

From these existing conditions, the village head since 2018 has started planning to answer the problems faced to develop the potential of the village owned, and the village government is well aware that the potential of the village will not develop without the involvement of other parties outside the government. The village government has begun to invite the private sector through corporate social responsibility (CSR) programs to provide capital support, as well as Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) to provide training to the community.

The private involvement in question is Bank Rakyat Indonesia (BRI) Sofifi Unit and the State Shelf Company (PLN) Galala Unit to build several facilities such as an art performance stage at Doe Masure Beach, Balbar Village as said by the Head of Balbar Village, Amir Abdullah in the interview excerpt below:

"This collaboration process does require commitment from all parties, especially in terms of open and transparent communication We collaborate with the Ternate Branch Job Training Center (BLK) to conduct training and several companies around the village to help with capital and marketing of village products. With the help of CSOs, we also provide skills training to the community to improve the quality of the products produced," said the Head of Balbar Village (Interview, 2024).

One of the important initiatives in this collaboration is the development of BERKAH Village-Owned Enterprises (BUMDes), which is the driving force of the local economy. BUMDes Berkah manages businesses in the tourism sector. With capital participation from the village government.

Training on the Balbar Village business group is carried out on an ongoing basis by the Ternate Branch Job Training Center (BLK), and the training is in accordance with the request of the Balbar Village government, North Oba District. This is as explained by the head of BLK Ternate Branch as follows:

"When the Balbar Village government wrote and came to us to ask for training for business groups, we immediately scheduled and conducted direct training in Balbar Village, and all costs were provided by the Ternate Branch BLK," said the Head of the Ternate BLK Branch (Interview, 2024).

The responsiveness of the Ternate Branch Job Training Center (BLK) at the request of the Balbar Village government to conduct training for business groups is a good collaborative step to utilize the resources owned.

The training conducted by the Ternate Branch Job Training Center (BLK) was also revealed by one of the participants who had participated in the training as in the excerpt of the interview results below:

"Our involvement as a community is sometimes hindered by a lack of understanding of each other's roles, so we really need capacity building training like the training we participated in conducted by the Job Training Center (BLK)." (Informant 2, Community Representative, interview in 2024).

From the results of some of the interviews mentioned above based on the theory of *Collaborative Governance* by (Anshall & Gash, 2007), this stage is a process that starts from the *starting conditions*, *institutional design*, and *facilitative leadership*). Analysis of interview data shows that the initial conditions in Balbar Village have typical challenges, such as low education levels and limited access to village development information using the following stages of *collaborative governance*:

a. Starting Conditions, Institutional Design, Facilitative Leadership

Collaborative governance requires an important stage **First, Starting Conditions**: The initial conditions in Balbar Village show that there is an inequality of power among stakeholders. Local governments play a dominant role in decision-making, while communities and NGOs still play a reactive role. This can be seen from interviews with informants who emphasized that the government often makes decisions without fully involving the community, especially in the planning stage. This unfavorable initial condition requires efforts from the government to strengthen the capacity of the community to be more actively involved.

In accordance with the results of the research on starting condition in accordance with the results of research conducted by . In his research, he explained that the role of the government is very dominant so that the living space of the community, and the private sector is very limited in taking part to collaborate. With the collaboration of each actor (government, private and

community) having their respective equal roles, the order only positions as a facilitator. This pattern of government collaboration has then been carried out by the Balbar village government since 2016 involving the private sector and the community in planning, implementing and evaluating programs ([Dahlia, 2023](#)).

Second, Institutional Design: Institutional design in *Collaborative Governance* in Tidore is beginning to show signs of inclusivity. However, the existing design is still not fully participatory. The main weakness is the lack of a structured communication forum between the community, the government, and NGOs. The community still needs a stronger platform for open discussion so that all parties feel their voices are heard.

The institutional role in collaborative governance in realizing Balbar as an Independent Village in Tidore Islands City has not been running optimally, this is in accordance with the findings of our research. Institutional design is an important factor in collaboration, communication between actors needs to be strengthened in order to overcome problems that arise in village governance ([Akbar et al., 2022](#)).

Institutional design is very important and should be improved in the future so that the sustainability of Balbar village's independence is well maintained, as well as strengthening communication between actors initiated by the village head and his staff to maintain the stability of good governance.

Third, Facilitative Leadership: Facilitative leadership from local governments is acknowledged by some informants as a positive aspect, although there is still room for improvement in terms of cross-sectoral coordination. Effective leadership can be seen in the initial implementation of the independent village program, but technical and bureaucratic obstacles are still an obstacle. It has begun to see changes on the ground, but often decisions are delayed due to bureaucratic differences between local and central governments Click or tap here to enter text. ([Permani et al., 2021](#)).

In context *Collaborative Governance*, initial condition (*starting conditions*) is an important factor that affects the effectiveness of collaboration. Balbar Village shows that the imbalance of power between stakeholders, especially the dominance of local governments in decision-making, is an obstacle to community participation. As ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)) have shown, this imbalance can slow down the collaborative process, as those with less power tend to feel less involved in the planning and implementation of institutional programs (*institutional design*) in Balbar has not been fully participatory, although there are efforts to involve more actors in decision-making. According to , the success of ([Asrari et al., 2020; Emerson et al., 2012](#)) *Collaborative Governance* relies heavily on how institutional design is able to create inclusive forums and enable effective dialogue between actors. However, the research shows that the communication mechanism in Balbar still needs improvement.

Facilitative leadership (*facilitative leadership*) in Balbar Village plays an important role in encouraging collaboration. As outlined by, leadership that supports collaboration must be able to facilitate complex processes, including overcoming differences of interest and easing conflicts between parties. However, in this area, they are still faced with bureaucratic obstacles that affect the smooth implementation of the program ([Huxham & Vagen, 2013](#)).

b. Interaction Process (Face-to-Face Dialogue, Trust Building, and Commitment to the Process)

The stages of face-to-face interaction, trust building, and commitment to the collaboration process are key aspects of *Collaborative Governance*. Interview data shows that face-to-face interaction between stakeholders is still limited, mainly due to the lack of frequency of formal and informal meetings.

First, Face-to-Face Dialogue: The limitations of face-to-face dialogue that are often interrupted by stakeholder schedules are a major challenge. Although formal meetings have been held, many people feel that they are not involved enough. Like only being involved during a big meeting, but there are rarely small meetings where we can express our opinions directly. This shows the importance of improving informal communication mechanisms to strengthen relations between parties.

Face-to-face dialogue (*face-to-face dialogue*) is an important element in building trust and commitment in the collaboration process. According to him, regular face-to-face meetings can strengthen relationships between stakeholders and ensure a transparent exchange of information. However, this research in Balbar, formal meetings held by the government are not enough to build sustainable communication between the government, the community, and NGOs.

Second Trust Building: The trust-building process between the community and the government seems to be taking shape, although there is still skepticism, especially from the public who feel that decisions are often taken before the discussion begins. Starting to trust the government's intentions, but we need more concrete evidence on the ground to really be sure that they care about our needs. The trust-building process (*trust building*) in Balbar is still in its early stages, and some informants feel that their involvement in decision-making has not been maximized. states that trust is a key factor in ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)) *Collaborative Governance*, and without trust, collaboration tends to run slowly or stall. This can be seen from the response that they feel that decisions have often been made before they are involved in the dialogue process.

Third, Commitment to the Process: Commitment to the collaboration process is evident from all stakeholders, even though bureaucratic and resource challenges are still an obstacle to achieving long-term goals. The government has a strong commitment, but a commitment without adequate resources will slow down this process.

Commitment to the process (*commitment to the process*) is also an important aspect of success *Collaborative Governance*. As expressed by, a strong commitment from all parties, both the government, the community, and NGOs, is needed to maintain the sustainability of collaboration. However, in Balbar, the limited resources of the bureaucracy often hinder the implementation of the program as planned ([Emerson et al., 2012](#)).

c. Outcomes and Impact on Program Success

In the context of *Collaborative Governance*, the success of the program is not only measured by short-term results but also by its impact on the sustainability of development and community

empowerment. The results of the interview show that the success of the independent village program in Balbar is starting to be seen, although the implementation process is slow by paying attention;

First, *Short-Term Outcomes*, Short-term successes include increased community participation in planning discussions and increased awareness of the importance of cross-sector collaboration. The community is starting to show greater interest in the sustainability of the program. **Second, *Long-Term Impact***, *The* long-term impact is still difficult to measure, but there is optimism that with the improvement of the communication and coordination system, this program will provide sustainable results. However, challenges remain, especially in terms of policy overlap and resource constraints.

Program success *Collaborative Governance* It is measured not only based on short-term results, but also its impact on development sustainability. As stated by , short-term results are often seen in increased community participation ([Emerson et al., 2012](#)).

Stakeholder Role

Collaborative governance is an approach in policy formulation and implementation that involves various stakeholders, both from the public, private, and civil society sectors. This concept emphasizes the importance of cooperation between various parties to achieve more effective and sustainable results compared to an approach managed by a single entity.

The role of stakeholders in *collaborative governance* It covers several key aspects such as first, Provision of Resources and Support, Stakeholders, especially from the public sector, act as facilitators who provide the necessary resources, policies, and support for collaboration. The public sector must create an environment that supports collaboration, not just as the final decision-maker. Second, Innovation and Efficiency, The private sector brings innovation and efficiency into collaborative processes. Through active participation, the private sector can introduce creative new approaches to problem-solving and resource management. Third, Local Community Involvement: Local communities play an important role in ensuring that the policies taken are in accordance with the needs and aspirations of their communities. This involvement increases the legitimacy and acceptance of the policy. Fourth, Conflict Management and Synergy, Effective conflict management and the creation of synergies between stakeholders are critical factors in achieving effective and sustainable results. A good collaborative process mitigates conflict and harnesses collective strength for optimal outcomes. Fifth, Transparency and Accountability: Open and transparent communication between stakeholders is the key to building trust and accountability. This strengthens the active participation and commitment of all parties involved ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)).

In accordance with the results of research in the field, it was found that the success of collaborative governance in realizing Balbar as an independent village in Tidore Islands City, was undermined by the importance of open and transparent communication from the Balbar village government, as shown in the interview excerpt below

"The success of this collaboration is highly dependent on the ability of each stakeholder to communicate openly and transparently, so that we the public know clearly the intentions and objectives," (Interview in 2024).

The statement mentioned above can illustrate that effective communication is the key in building trust between stakeholders. Recent research by Transparency in communication supports this by showing that transparency in communication increases the active participation and commitment of all parties involved, which in turn strengthens success ([O'Leary & Vij, 2012](#)) *collaborative governance*.

In addition, the results of the interview with the head of the Community Empowerment Office (PMD) of Tidore Islands City explained that the local government has carried out its duties and functions as facilitators for 49 (forty-nine) villages in Tidore Islands City, as in the interview excerpt below:

"The government's role in *collaborative governance* is as a facilitator who provides resources and support, not as the final decision-maker, so every Village Assembly, we only facilitate that program proposals be synchronized with the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) of Tidore Islands City," ([Zulkifli Ohorela, interview in 2024](#)).

Judging from the results of the interviews above, it can be illustrated that stakeholders from the public sector must focus on empowering and supporting local initiatives rather than controlling the process. This is in line with the findings from , which underscore the importance of the government's role in creating a conducive environment for collaboration by providing supportive resources and policies Click or tap here to enter text. ([Nooteboom, 1996](#)).

In accordance with the results of an interview with one of the business actors in *the Doe Masure* tour , Balbar Village explained that cooperation between others can help and increase community participation in collaborating with each other, as in the excerpt of the interview results below:

"Collaboration between stakeholders can mitigate conflicts and create greater synergy, so we small and medium businesses that get stalls at Doe Masure tourism in Balbar Village get income that really helps our daily needs," ([Apriyana Ningkeula, Interview in 2024](#)).

From the explanation mentioned above, it can be illustrated that effective conflict management and the creation of synergy can optimize the results of collaboration. Research shows that conflict management and synergy between stakeholders are critical factors in achieving effective and sustainable results in ([Anshall & Gash, 2007](#)) *collaborative governance*. In governance collaboration, each stakeholder plays an important role; (a) The Village Government is responsible for the overall planning and coordination of the program. The government also plays a role in ensuring that the programs developed are in line with the needs of the community and oriented towards village independence, (b) the private sector provides capital support and market access. One of the companies involved provides assistance in the form of CSR funds for the initial capital of BUMDes and expands the marketing of village products to a wider market, (c)

Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) provide training and technical assistance. For example, local CSOs provide training on Small and Medium Enterprises and business management to farmers and fishermen in the village, (d) Village communities play an active role in every program implemented, both as business actors and workers in BUMDes business units. Community participation is very important in supporting the success of the program.

Success of *Collaborative Governance Programs*

Governance collaboration programs have yielded positive results, especially in the agriculture and fisheries sectors. One of the real successes is the increase in visitors at Doe Masure Beach and MSME actors, which not only increases people's income, but also strengthens the economic independence of the village.

This was revealed by one of the MSME actors at Doe Masure Beach. When interviewed, it was revealed that before the opening of Doe Masure Beach by BUMDes Berkah Balbar village, the income could not be estimated, but the pacsas concerned sold at Doe Masure Beach stalls, his income increased as quoted in the interview below:

"Since being involved in the MSME training program, and the opening of Doe Masure beach tourism, my income has doubled. Many visitors come to Doe Masure Beach," said one of the MSME business actors at Doe Masore Beach (Interview, 2024).

BUMDes has also succeeded in opening new jobs for rural communities, thereby reducing the unemployment rate. To overcome the obstacles faced in the process of governance collaboration in Balbar Village towards an independent village, several strategies involving various stakeholders are needed. The following are the steps that can be taken to overcome these obstacles: first, to increase people's financial literacy, one of the main obstacles is the low financial literacy of the community, which makes it difficult for them to manage profits from businesses run by Village-Owned Enterprises (BUMDes) or other business units. To overcome this, it is necessary to do; Second, Financial Training and Education Village governments and BUMDes can partner with local banks or financial institutions to conduct training on personal and business financial management. This training can include how to save, manage debt, make a budget, and understand investments.

In addition, individual capacity building training, especially on the management ability of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs), continues to be carried out as revealed by one of the administrators of the Balbar Village Bumdes as in the interview excerpt below:

"The community needs continuous training to understand financial management. This cannot be completed with just one training," explained one of the BUMDes administrators (Interview, 2024).

At the time of the MSME training, the government of Balbar Village, North Oba District, Tidore Islands City, collaborated with the Ternate City Job Training Center (BLK) to be facilitated. This expression was conveyed by the head of Balbar Village during an interview as the following interview excerpt:

"Counseling and training are regularly carried out by the Ternate City Job Training Center (BLK), involving facilitators from CSOs to conduct regular financial counseling so that people can practice and develop their understanding in the long term," (explained the Head of Balbar Village, interview, 2024).

From this information, it can be illustrated that capacity building is one of the important indoctrinators in realizing Balbar as an independent village in Tidore Islands City. Capacity building is a process, not an expected result, this is in accordance with the description of emphasizing that organizational capacity development is a process that must be passed to compete in improving competence to be able to compete internally and externally. [\(Grindle, 1997\)](#)

Expanding Access to Technology and Information

Balbar Village is the only independent village in Tidore Islands City, one of the driving factors is through the village government to open access to technology and information to Bumdes Berkah who manages *Doe Masure Tourism*, to be published on social media

- a) The lack of access to information technology is an obstacle in product marketing and improving people's skills. To address this issue;
- b) Provision of Technological Infrastructure, the village government can work with internet service providers to expand the internet network in the village, so that the community can connect with the digital market and get the latest information related to their business.
- c) E-Commerce and Social Media Training, held training for the community on how to use e-commerce and social media to sell village products. This can involve *an online* business community that can help people optimize platforms such as marketplaces, Instagram, or WhatsApp Business.

Some of the steps taken above as explained by the Director of Bumdes Berkah Balbar Village as in the interview excerpt below:

"With access to the internet, we can expand the promotion of *Doe Masure* beach tourism outside the area and increase revenue, and every weekend many visitors come to Doe Masure Beach to relax," said the Director of Bumdes Berkah (Interview, 2024).

From the results of the interview above, it can be illustrated that the access to technology and information provided to the public to publicize Doe Masure Beach on various social media platforms has an impact on the increase in local tourists visiting *Doe Masure Beach*.

The important role of access to information and technology in tourism development is very important. One of the factors for the development of tourism in Indonesia is underdeveloped because it has not maximized the role of technology and confirmation [\(Milandika et al., 2024\)](#).

Table 2. Targets and Realization of Tourist Visits at *Doe Masure Tourism*

It	Tourist	2021		2022		2023	
		Target	Realizatio n	Target	Realizatio n	Target	Realizatio n

Collaboration Governance in Realizing Balbar as an Independent Village in Kota Tidore Kepulauan

Muksin and Djamal

1	Local Tourists	14.558	12.889	15.700	14.551	18.500	15.926
2	National Tourist	1200	300	1.200	634	1.200	7.412
3	Foreign Tourists	300	0	300	0	300	0

Source: Processed from BUMDes Files, 2024

In accordance with the data in table 2, it can be illustrated that the average tourist who visits *Doe Masure* tourism in Balbar Village, Tidore Islands City is local tourists from the target, while national tourism is still far from the target, while foreign tourism is still nil. This indicates that *Doe Masure*'s tourism management has not maximized technology to promote.

In the current era of digitalization, the role of digital is very important, especially in promoting village tourism. The development of digital marketing needs to be carried out in promoting tourism in the countryside, because the opportunity for tourist access at all levels of society through digitalization is quite large and has great potential. Thus, the role of digital marketing in promoting rural tourism such as tourism ([Darmayanti et al., 2023](#)) *Doe Masure* in Balbar Village, Tidore City is very important, but with the limited number of human resources needs to be increased in the future.

Increasing Community Participation in BUMDes Programs

Community participation in Balbar Village, North Oba District, Tidore Islands City is quite high in planning and implementing village development so that Balbar Village will become the only independent village in Tidore Islands City in 2022. This increase in community participation starts from the development planning process involving *stakeholders* (community leaders, religious leaders, youth leaders, women, business actors) in formulating urgent needs according to their respective characteristics.

The high participation of the people of Balbar Village as explained by the Head of Balbar Village as in the excerpt of the interview results below:

"Since the inauguration of the first period 2016-2021, I have approached all community leaders, and invited them to participate in village development planning deliberations (Musdes). Providing opportunities for the community to propose programs in accordance with their interests, and we implement these proposals in the form of programs financed through the Village Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBDes) so that community participation is very high" (Interview, 2024).

In accordance with the excerpt of the interview with the head of Balbar Village above, the data illustrates that the increasing participation of the people of Balbar Village in making Balbar an independent village, one of the indicators is to involve the community in development planning, and not just propose, but the proposal is implemented and implemented using the Village Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBDes) every year.

The involvement of the Balbar Village community was also conveyed by the village secretary as in the interview excerpt below:

"Since 2016, the Balbar Village Government has taken a persuasive approach with all community leaders who are considered influential in the village, to provide understanding,

explanation of the importance of village development, socialization during official and non-official meetings, that village management requires community participation, and what is proposed by the village government community is the budget allocation," (Interview, 2024).

From the explanation above, it is revealed that communication, socialization of the village government to the community is very important, there is no distance between the village government and the community in building villages, other important indicators that need to be considered so that the community feels that they own and love their village. This is because the low participation of the community is caused by uncertainty of results and lack of understanding of the benefits of the program. To increase community participation. In addition, continuous dosialization, village governments and BUMDes must conduct intensive and continuous socialization to explain the direct benefits of village programs, such as increased income, market access, and new job opportunities. This can be done through regular village meetings, local media, and *focus group discussions*.

The increasing participation of the people of Balbar Village in realizing Balbar as an independent village as expressed by the Head of Development Affairs as follows:

"With regular socialization, more and more residents are interested in being involved in the program, especially when they see tangible results, for example the management of *Doe Masure Beach*, which is growing rapidly so that public trust in the village government is getting higher and therefore community participation in village development is also high," explained KAUR Pembangunan Desa Balbar (Interview, 2024).

From the explanation of the Balbar Village Development KAUR above, it is revealed that socialization in a sustainable manner accompanied by the allocation of APBDes and implemented in the program can trigger the high participation of the Balbar community in realizing Balbar as an independent village in Tidore Islands City, in addition to that transparency and accountability of village finances are the key to success in encouraging high community participation.

This study revealed significant changes in the indicators of Balbar village independence from year to year. Based on the results of data analysis obtained through in-depth observation and interviews, changes in independence indicators can be seen in the aspects of increasing community participation, transparency in village fund management, and strengthening local institutions. The following table shows the development of village independence indicators during the three years of research implementation:

Table 3. Indicators of Balbar Village Independence Achievement

It	Independence Indicators	Developments Per Year				
		2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
1	Community Participation (%)	50%	60%	75%	80%	85%
2	Transparency of Village Fund Management	Keep	Tall	Tall	Tall	Tall
3	Local Actor Involvement	Keep	Tall	Tall	Tall	Tall

Independent Program Management					
4 (%)	40%	45%	55%	70%	85%

Data Source: Processed by Researcher, 2024

From table 3. Above, it can be seen that the level of community participation in village deliberation activities increased from 45% in the first year to 75% in the third year. This increase occurs in line with increased transparency in the management of village funds, which allows residents to feel more confident in the village government and play an active role in decision-making. Interviews with stakeholders, including village heads and community leaders, confirmed that collaborative efforts between the village government and the community have fostered a sense of belonging and responsibility towards the development program.

In terms of the involvement of local actors, such as farmer groups, artisans, and local community organizations, there has been a significant increase from year to year. At the beginning of the study, the involvement of these actors was still low, due to distrust in the effectiveness of collaboration with the government. However, with the introduction of a more inclusive and participatory Collaborative Governance mechanism, the role of local actors is increasing, especially in planning and implementing community-based economic development programs. For example, one of the economic empowerment programs launched in the second year, namely the development of local products, has succeeded in driving the village economy and making a real contribution to increasing community income.

However, this study also identifies several challenges in achieving the goal of village self-reliance. Some of the challenges faced are difficulties in managing conflicts between local actors, especially in terms of resource distribution and strategic decision-making. In-depth interviews with community leaders revealed that despite increased participation, there are often disagreements between community groups regarding development priorities. In addition, the limited human resources who have managerial capacity at the village level are an obstacle in accelerating the implementation of more complex programs.

Overall, the results of this analysis confirm that the *Collaborative Governance* approach has had a positive impact on increasing the independence of Balbar village. However, to achieve a full level of independence, sustained efforts are needed to strengthen the capacity of local actors and improve inter-party conflict management mechanisms.

CONCLUSION

This study shows that governance collaboration plays an important role in efforts to realize Balbar Village as an independent village. Collaboration between village governments, communities, the private sector, and CSOs can accelerate the achievement of self-reliance, but challenges such as low financial literacy and suboptimal communication must be addressed. Increasing financial literacy, strengthening the capacity of BUMDes, and effective communication forums are the keys to overcoming these obstacles and achieving the goal of independent villages.

To the Balbar Village government, Tidore Islands City maintains the sustainability of good collaborative governance and in the future can increase financial literacy, digital literacy to Bumdes Berkah managers to promote *Doe Masure tourism* through digital. The development of future research needs to be further explored to develop the institutional capacity of the village and the innovation of the Balbar village government in realizing Balbar as independent in the city of Tidore Islands.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded by the Directorate of Research, Technology and Community Service (DRTPM) of the Ministry, Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology (Kemendikbudristek) through the Beginner Lecturer Research (PDP) scheme for the 2024 Fiscal Year. We would like to express our gratitude and appreciation to all parties who have participated in this research.

REFERENCE

- Akbar, R., Supriyono, B., & Domai, T. (2022). Collaborative Governance in the Development of Gubungklakah Tourism Village, Malang Regency. *Scientific Journal of Public Administration (JLAP)*, 8(2), 170–177.
- Anshall, C., & Gash, A. (2007). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 543–571.
- Arma, N. A. (2023). Collaborative Governance in Village Smart Village Development. *PUBLIC: Journal of Human Resource Management Administration and Public Service*, 10(2), 492–502.
- Asrari, A., Ansari, M., Khazaei, J., & Fajri, P. (2020). A Market Framework for Decentralized Congestion Management in Smart Distribution Grids Considering Collaboration among Electric Vehicle Aggregators. *IEEE Transactions on Smart Grid*, 11(2), 1147–1158. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TSG.2019.2932695>
- Bae, Y., Joo, Y.-M., & Won, S.-Y. (2016). Decentralization and collaborative disaster governance: Evidence from South Korea. *Habitat International*, 52, 50–56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2015.08.027>
- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Stone, M. M. (2006). The Design and Implementation of Cross-Sector Collaborations: Propositions from the Literature. *Administration Review*, 44–55.
- Creswell, J. W. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Method Approaches*. SAGE Publication.
- Dahlia, N. (2023). Efforts to Realize Good Governance through Collaborative Governance in Bumdesa Management. *Journal of Governance Innovation*, 5(1), 61–79.
- Darmayanti, P. W., Oka, I. D., & Hidayana, F. F. (2023). The Role of Digital Marketing in the Development of Tourism Villages in Tabanan Regency. *Journal of Tourism Studies and Applications (JKPT)*, 3(2), 21–29.

- Druzca, K. (2019). “At least the government is watching out for us now”: Dalit perceptions and experiences of governance and cash transfers in three villages in sarlahi, Nepal. *Modern Asian Studies*, 53(6), 2041–2078. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0026749X17001056>
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An Integrative Framework for Collaborative. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 22(1), 1–29.
- Febrian, R. A. (2016). Collaborative Governance in Rural Area Development (Review of Concepts and Regulations. *Journal of Government, Politics and Bureaucracy*, 11(1), 200–2008.
- Gurvantry, D., Febriansah, A., & Tampubolon, J. (2022). Analysis of Collaborative Governance in the Development of Tourism Village Areas. *Journal of Public Administration*, 1(3), 174–178.
- Gustafsson, M.-T., & Scurrah, M. (2023). Subnational governance strategies at the extractive frontier: collaboration and conflict in Peru. *Territory, Politics, Governance*, 11(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21622671.2020.1840425>
- Huxham, C., & Vagen, S. (2013). *Managing to Collaborate The Theory and Practice of Collaborative Advantage*. London.
- Ibrahim, A.-S., Akanbang, B. A. A., Nunbogu, A. M., Kuusaana, E. D., & Ahmed, A. (2020). Collaborative customary land governance: Motivations and challenges of forming land management committees (LMCs) in the upper west region of Ghana. *Land Use Policy*, 99. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2020.105051>
- Liu, J., Zhang, X., Lin, J., & Li, Y. (2022). Beyond government-led or community-based: Exploring the governance structure and operating models for reconstructing China’s hollowed villages. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 93, 273–286. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2019.10.038>
- Margerum, R. D., Lewis, R., & Dobrinich, S. (2019). Collaborative metropolitan governance: An evaluation of local adoption in Denver. *Cities*, 93, 136–144. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2019.04.010>
- Milandika, K. B., Yudartha, I. D., & Wirantari, I. A. (2024). Collaborative Governance in the Sustainable Development of Kamasan Tourism Village. *Socio-Political Communication and Policy Review*, 1(5), 23–36.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1992). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. UI Press.
- Noor, M., Suedi, F., & Mardiyanta, A. (2022). *Collaborative Governance: A Review of Theory and Practice*. Bildung.
- Nooteboom, B. (1996). Trust, Opportunism and Governance: A Process and Control Model. *Organization Studies*, 17(6), 985–1010.
- O’Leary, R., & Vij, N. (2012). Collaborative Public Management: Where Have We Been and Where Are We Going? *The American Review of Public Administration*, 42(5), 507–522.
- Permani, R., Asep, S., & Sugandi, Y. S. (2021). Collaborative Governance in Poverty Reduction in Bandung City. *Scientific Journal of Public Administration: Journal of Public Administration Thought and Research*, 11(1), 25–39.

- Previtali, P., & Salvati, E. (2021). Area social plans and local governance of interorganizational collaborations. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, *13*(2), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13020545>
- Satria, O., & Letari, R. P. (2022). Collaborative Governance in the Government System of Tanjung Pauh Mudik Village, Kerinci Regency. *Journal of Local Politics and Government Studies*, *2*(2), 138–152.
- Thapa, D., Farid, M. N., & Prevost, C. (2022). Governance drivers of rural water sustainability: Collaboration in frontline service delivery. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, *6*(1). <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v6i1.1380>
- Wang, H., & Yuan, L. (2021). Why good governance goes wrong: Government and village in the supply of public goods in rural China. *Rural China*, *18*(2), 192–223. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22136746-12341274>
- Zakia, E. L., & Wicaksono, I. (2023). Collaborative Governance in Realizing a Foreign Exchange Village in Sidomulyo Village, Silo District, Jember Regency. *TRILOGY: Journal of Social and Exact Science Research*, *3*(1), 1–11.
- Zeppel, H. (2012). Collaborative governance for low-carbon tourism: Climate change initiatives by Australian tourism agencies. *Current Issues in Tourism*, *15*(7), 603–626. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2011.615913>