



Collaborative Governance in Overcoming Tuberculosis Cases in the Riau Islands Province

Nonie Talaallayna¹, Novi Winarti²

^{1,2}Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji, Indonesia

Correspondent: nonietalaallayna@gmail.com¹

Received : March 9, 2024

Accepted : April 28, 2024

Published : April 30, 2024

Citation: Talaallayna, N., Winarti, N. (2024). Collaborative Governance in Overcoming Tuberculosis Cases in the Riau Islands Province. *Ilomata International Journal of Social Science*, 5(2), 615-627.
<https://doi.org/10.61194/ijss.v5i2.1225>

ABSTRACT: Riau Islands is one of the provinces that handles TB cases by carrying out a collaborative process, which is stated in the Decree of the Riau Islands Province Tuberculosis Management Acceleration Team in 2022. This research aims to find out the collaboration process carried out by stakeholders involved in tackling TB cases in Islands Province Riau. This research uses a qualitative approach. by presenting the results descriptively, what is used is qualitative data analysis, namely data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing/verification to present the findings in a structured manner. Then the results are described based on the dynamics of collaborative governance according to Ansell and Gash, which uses five indicators, namely face to face, trust building, commitment to process, shared understanding, intermediated outcomes. The research results, the collaboration has been reduction the TB cases in the Riau Islands province, but this is not significant when compared to the target to be achieved. Apart from that, there are still cases that have not been reported by Health Service Facilities to the Tuberculosis Information System. So future changes or revisions regarding collaboration are still needed to make it easier to handle the obstacles faced by stakeholders.

Keywords: Collaborative Governance, Tuberculosis, Case Management, Collaboration Process



This is an open access article under the
CC-BY 4.0 license

INTRODUCTION

This research focuses on collaborative governance carried out by the Riau Islands Provincial Government through the Riau Islands Provincial Health Service as the lead sector or implementing element, together with the private sector and the community, in efforts to tackle tuberculosis cases in the Riau Islands Province region. The government, as the highest legal organization in a country, has primary and secondary functions.

One of the primary functions that the government must carry out is the service function, which is to achieve the goals of the Indonesian State ([Angger, 2015](#); [Anwar, 2014](#); [Arai et al., 2021](#)). One of the priority focuses of government service functions is in the health sector, which is one of the priorities for developing the human resources of a nation and state ([Lorwena, 2021](#)). One of the health issues that is part of the government's elimination program is efforts to control tuberculosis. Tuberculosis (TB) is a deadly global health problem and is caused by the bacterium *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* ([Stephenson & Byard, 2019](#)).

TB is a major concern in Indonesia, which is the third largest contributor to the global TB burden. Based on the 2022 Global TB Report, Indonesia has the third largest number of TB sufferers in the world after India and China, with estimated 969,000 TB cases that year ([World Health Organization, 2022](#)). According from the data, 443,235 TB cases were found in 2021 and this increased to 724,309 cases in 2022 in Indonesia. Then in 2023, there was a decline with 575,636 cases found in Indonesia ([Pemerintah Provinsi Kepulauan Riau, 2023](#)).

Table 1. Tuberculosis cases found in Indonesia 2021-2023

Year	TB Cases
2021	443.235
2022	724.309
2023	575.636

Source: Pemerintah Provinsi Kepulauan Riau, 2023

The Riau Islands Province is no exception, and it is not immune from global health problems. In 2021, the Riau Islands are in the top 20 provinces with the most TB cases, with a total of 4,201 TB cases. The Riau Islands are an archipelago geographical province with a population of 2,064,564 people. Which has an area of 251,810.71 km², 96 percent of which is water with 1,350 large and small islands, has shown progress in carrying out government, development, and community activities. The number of case discoveries in the Riau Islands from 2021 to the third quarter of 2023 continues to increase, which are shown in the table below:

Table 2. Tuberculosis cases found in the Riau Islands 2021-2023

Year	TB Cases
2021	4.021
2022	5.866
2023	6.081

Source: Dinas Kesehatan Provinsi Kepulauan Riau, 2023

Based on data from the Tuberculosis Information System (SITB), the number of cases found in 2021 was 4,021 cases, in 2022 it was 5,866 cases, in 2023 it was 6,081 cases, which still has the potential to continue to increase. Every year, the number of cases in the Riau Islands continues to exceed estimates set by the Ministry of Health. However, there are still cases that have not been reported by health service facilities to SITB ([Dinas Kesehatan Provinsi Kepulauan Riau, 2023](#)).

Efforts to control TB in Indonesia are regulated by Regulation of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Indonesia Number 67 of 2016, which sets targets for eliminating TB by 2035 and a TB-free Indonesia by 2050. The national strategy for controlling TB includes strengthening program leadership, increasing access to quality services, controlling risk factors, increasing partnerships, fostering community independence, and strengthening program management. The importance of collaboration between stakeholders, both from the public, private, and community sectors, is reflected in Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 67 of 2021. Apart from that, efforts to control TB are also part of the policy direction and strategy for national health development 2020–2024, which is part of the Long Term Plan for Health (RPJPK) 2005–2025 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Indonesia. The main objective of controlling tuberculosis stated in the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2020–2024 and the Indonesian Ministry of Health's national health development strategy 2020–2024 is to reduce the incidence of TB from 319 per 100,000 population in 2017 to 190 per 100,000 population in 2024 ([Probandari et al., 2020](#)).

This series of actions cannot be separated from the role of key actors who played a role in the success of controlling TB cases in Indonesia. One of the strategies implemented is to actively involve all health service providers through collaboration of services from the government and private sectors. Collaboration is a concept that describes a facilitation and implementation process involving multiple organizations to solve problems that cannot or are not easily solved by one organization alone. Collaborative governance is a new paradigm for understanding the existence of stakeholders related to public affairs. Collaboration also describes the implementation of formal, explicit, and collective-oriented cooperation in decision making ([Bae et al., 2016](#); [Kim, 2016](#); [Nurharjadmo & Nurhayati, 2022](#); [Sønderskov, 2019](#)).

In the science of government, collaboration between stakeholders is absorbed in its application as collaborative governance. Emerson, et. al. (2011) in defines collaborative governance more broadly. This definition includes processes and structures for policy decision making and public management that involve many people constructively across the boundaries of public institutions, levels of government and/or public, private and community spheres. Goals in the public interest that will not be achieved if such steps are not taken ([Martomo, 2017](#)). From this explanations, it can be seen that collaborative governance exists to expand participation between partners, especially the general public, private sector and regions in controlling government, as well as the government's work and reactions in efforts to handle public problems. The contribution of the public area (government) to the private area and the community as partners will make the public area more empowered and effective ([Gestel & Grotenbreg, 2021](#); [Greenway, 2021](#)).

There are three actors who influence the governance process. The three actors, namely the government, the private sector, and the community, collaborate with each other in the government administration process to achieve the stated goals. The government no longer monopolizes government because it no longer acts as a sole actor, but requires other actors because of the government's limited capacity. The government plays a role as a motivator, regulator, facilitator, monitoring and evaluate. The private sector can provide new innovations that can be adopted or collaborate with the government to support development. Meanwhile, the community's position really requires their contribution through active participation, which can be done by forming an organization ([Rosidi & Anggraeni, 2013;Made Dwi Arisanti & Wayan Suderana, 2020](#))

Riau Islands Province is one of the areas that involves collaboration between sectors, especially to tackle TB cases. The existence of stakeholder collaboration in tackling tuberculosis is stated in the Decree of the 2022 Riau Islands Province Tuberculosis Prevention Acceleration Team. Apart from the government, the private sector and the community also take part in this collaboration. It is hoped that the collaboration that exists will be able to overcome TB cases. Based on research conducted by Melat Memberu, Sonali Kar, and Manas Ranjan Behera in 2022 entitled "Monitoring of combined public and private sector-based TB control strategies in India," PLG is proven and tested as an effective strategy for achieving the global TB eradication target, including in India. However, the research highlights the need to strengthen and encourage the public sector to involve private practitioners in specific areas and coordinate their activities with general programs. A monitoring and evaluation system that is carried out regularly and in a structured manner is important to achieve the target of eliminating TB by 2025 ([Memberu et al., 2022](#)).

Based on the Decree of the Riau Islands Province Tuberculosis Control Acceleration Team in 2022, the Riau Islands Province already has a collaboration team to deal with TB cases. However, data on the number of cases based on SITB is still increasing and cases are still found that have not been reported by health service facilities to SITB. Therefore, it is necessary to look at the ongoing collaboration process based on the applicable decree and what obstacles are faced by stakeholders to overcome TB cases in the Riau Islands Province. Because the course of collaboration in overcoming TB cases will not be separated from the factors that influence it as well. Sudarmo, identified a number of factors that could hinder the implementation of collaboration in governance ([Sudarmo, 2011](#)). These factors include social structural factors, cultural factors and government interest factors that can cause collaboration to fail, including the active participation of various stakeholders in decision making. Therefore, these deficiencies and limitations can be supplemented with assistance and cooperation from the various parties involved and bound by mutual agreement ([Khasanah et al., 2021](#)).

The author uses the dynamics of collaborative governance according to Ansell and Gash, which uses 5 indicators, face to face, trust building, commitment to process, share understanding, intermediated outcomes to describe the collaboration process in the Riau Islands Province ([Brown et al., 2021](#)).

METHOD

This research adopts a qualitative approach by presenting the results descriptively. In accordance with the opinion of Moleong (2015), that qualitative research methods aim to understand phenomena, such as the behavior, perceptions, motivations and actions of research subjects, in the form of words and language ([Rita Fiantika et al., 2022](#)). The research subject involves the government, private sector, and community in Tanjungpinang City, with the main emphasis on explaining and describing the TB control process. Data collection was carried out through interviews and direct observation at the Provincial Health Service Office, Raja Ahmad Tabib Regional Hospital, and Pena Bulu Community Office, Riau Islands. Meanwhile, secondary data includes regulations, TB cases and related literature studies.

In data analysis, this research follows the method proposed by Miles and Huberman (1984), which involves activities such as data reduction, data display, and drawing conclusions or verification to organize findings in a structured manner ([Abdussamad, 2021](#)). Informants involved in the research included the Health Service, Perkumpulan Keluarga Berencana Indonesia (PKBI) Tuberculosis Coordinator, Raja Ahmad Tabib Regional Hospital Health Workers, and PKBI cadres. Informants are considered sources of factual information about situations and background conditions (Moleong, 2010). The results and discussion will be described based on the dynamics of collaborative governance according to Ansell and Gash, using five indicators, namely face to face dialogue, trust building, commitment to the process, mutual understanding, and interim results.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Collaborative governance emphasizes collaborative interaction between stakeholders and public institutions in consensus-oriented decision making ([Mustiasih, 2022](#)). Collaborative governance is a broad concept regarding the process of involving citizens in the decision-making process in a more inclusive manner. The definition of collaborative governance is a process and structure in the management and formulation of public policy decisions that constructively involves actors from various levels, both at the level of government or public agencies, private institutions, and civil society with the aim of achieving public goals that cannot be achieved if only implemented by one party ([Emerson et al., 2012](#)). Through the involvement of diverse parties, including the government, private sector, and civil society, collaborative governance seeks to achieve holistic and sustainable solutions to complex problems at the local, regional or national level. As is the case in this research which looks at the focus of collaboration used in the Riau Islands Province to tackle and find solutions related to global health problems, namely TB.

Then, collaborative governance according to ([Ansell & Gash, 2008](#)), a government or public agency regulation is characterized by the involvement of non-government stakeholders in a formal collective decision-making process, based on reaching agreement, and involving dialogue to create or implement public policy or manage public programs or assets. From this definition, there are six criteria that are very important in carrying out collaboration:

1. The forum is carried out by public institutions and actors within public institutions,
2. Non-public actor participants are also included in the forum,
3. Participants are directly involved in making and making decisions and decisions do not have to refer to public actors,
4. Forums are formally organized and meetings are held jointly,
5. The purpose of the forum is to make decisions based on mutual agreement,
6. Public policy and public management are the focus of collaboration.

In developing the collaboration concept, Ansell and Gash identified four key variables, namely initial conditions, institutional design, leadership variables, and collaboration processes. Each of these variables can be further detailed. The collaborative process is considered a core variable, while initial conditions, institutional design, and leadership variables are considered important contributions or contexts to the collaborative process. Initial conditions establish the basic level of trust, conflict, and social capital that become resources or liabilities during the course of the collaboration. In carrying out the collaboration process, five indicators are used: face to face, trust building, commitment to process, share understanding, and intermediate outcomes (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Which the author uses in research This presents a collaborative governance process for dealing with TB cases in the Riau Islands Province.

Face to Face

Face to face dialogue is a direct communication process between stakeholders that aims to build trust, mutual respect, mutual understanding, and commitment to collaboration. In a collaborative context, this direct interaction is considered a crucial initial stage in creating a solid foundation for effective collaboration. Face to face dialogue allows the parties involved to meet, interact, and convey ideas and hopes directly, creating a strong basis for reaching a common consensus. The formal meeting, Focus Group Discussion (FGD), received input from participants regarding the program to prevent the transmission of tuberculosis and produced a joint agreement, which was the aim of the meeting ([Mustiasih, 2022](#)).

Principled involvement is defined as obedience, communication and inclusiveness. The meetings held became a means to convey information, criticism and suggestions to each other for programs to prevent the transmission of tuberculosis in the future ([Mustiasih, 2022](#)). According to Bentrup in ([Ansell & Gash, 2008](#)), face to face dialogue is more than just a negotiation medium. This is at the heart of the process of breaking down stereotypes and other communication barriers that hinder the exploration of mutual benefits.

Based on the results of interviews with informants, the stakeholders who are important actors in overcoming TB cases in the Riau Islands can be concluded that a joint principle drive has been created through regular meetings, both formal and informal, for formal activities carried out periodically involving all stakeholders, for face to face meetings.

Usually carried out between the community and the health service with the aim of data validation. Face-to-face dialogue is needed to discuss case-finding strategies, challenges, opportunities, obstacles and follow-up plans for implementing the program.



Figure 1. Routine Coordination Activities across sectors and across programs

Source: Dinas Kesehatan Provinsi Kepulauan Riau, 2023

Trust Building

Building trust is an effort to build confidence that the parties actually have the same intentions for achieving common goals. Since collaboration involves not only bargaining but also building trust with each stakeholder, trust is a very important component. Ansell & Gash stated that stakeholders must have the same understanding of collaboration, such as vision and mission, goals, and problem compatibility (Eka et al., 2023). Lack of trust between stakeholders is a common starting point for collaborative governance because collaboration cannot be carried out if the actors involved still do not trust each other, even though they have the same goal of overcoming TB cases in the Riau Islands.

In trust building, based on the informant's explanation, it was explained that the effort to build trust and involve actors to participate in carrying out a collaborative process in dealing with TB cases in the Riau Islands Province was to make a report regarding minimum service standards that were not achieved to the Governor. Then, after reporting, it is reduced to a decision letter involving all actors to provide ideas for strategies to help reduce the burden of TB and achieve treatment and coverage rates that are in line with targets. Efforts to control TB in the Riau Islands Province, collaboration involving various actors, including the Education Service, the Ministry of Religion, and the community. For example, the Education Department is given the task of providing education to health workers about TB in school areas. Then, from the Ministry of Religion side, it helped the Health Service provide information regarding the number of boarding schools that had environments that caused TB. This involves the actors entering into a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) and working together to tackle TB cases in the Riau Islands Province.

Then, the community also took part in conducting outreach and increasing campaigns to increase understanding that TB is not a scary disease, it can be treated and cured if TB patients receive treatment in accordance with the provisions of health services, especially for the community. Meanwhile, for the actors in TB control, there is a kind of policy product to be equally committed to the fight, this is a form of government concern in the TB elimination process. This is stated in

accordance with the Governor's Decree, which is used as the basis for the responsibilities given to the actors involved.

This collaboration reflects a shared commitment to tackling TB, manifested in the form of policy products. The existence of a collective agreement and responsibility mandated by the Governor's Decree (SK) is the basis for the actors involved to jointly play an active role in eliminating TB. This not only creates government awareness but also illustrates the synergy between various sectors and components of society in carrying out their respective roles to achieve common goals in controlling TB.

Commitment to Process

In the context of collaborative governance, commitment reflects belief in the effectiveness of collaborative governance in creating significant benefits for all parties involved and the interests of society. The importance of commitment in this context highlights a crucial aspect of ensuring the sustainability and success of collaboration.

Commitment creates a strong basis for cooperation, strengthens relationships between stakeholders, and facilitates a balanced decision-making process. Therefore, building and maintaining a high level of commitment from all parties involved is a priority in efforts to realize effective and sustainable collaborative governance ([Arifin & Dewi, 2018](#)).

From the information obtained with informants, the Health Service as the leading control sector together with the actors involved are very open to TB information in accordance with related fields to help overcome TB cases in the Riau Islands Province. Like the TB screening service held on the anniversary of the Riau Islands Province Korem, the agencies involved prepared infrastructure for the community to carry out screening at the event. The commitment and motivation of the actors towards the tasks carried out in the collaborative process in overcoming TB cases is together towards the elimination of TB by 2030 and a TB-Free Indonesia by 2045. As a state commitment, it must work together to overcome TB cases in Indonesia, especially in the Riau Islands Province.

Then, implementing Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) is very important to ensure that each stakeholder carries out their duties in accordance with the agreements that have been reached in various related fields. The principle of equality between all stakeholders is the main basis for implementing this SOP, where each party has the same roles and responsibilities. The existence of SOP helps ensure consistency and efficiency in the actions taken so that mitigation efforts can proceed according to plan.

Although the principle of equality is upheld, the existence of mechanisms to respond to situations requiring further intervention needs to be clearly regulated. A firm action plan, such as reporting unresolved situations to the governor for further action, can be a strategic step. However, it is important to note that formal arrangements regarding follow-up procedures for certain violations or problems need to be clarified so that all parties understand and comply with the applicable rules. This can increase accountability and support transparent and effective collaborative governance. Therefore, formulating rules regarding follow-up to violations or problems is an important part of developing a comprehensive SOP.

Share Understanding

In the dynamics of a collaborative process, building shared understanding is an important key to achieving success. Share understanding, as involves joint efforts in identifying common values and reaching agreement on problem definitions. This process builds a sense of trust between the actors involved, making trust a crucial element in collaborative cooperation ([Ansell & Gash, 2008](#)). This trust brings concrete benefits, such as cooperation between the government, Non Governmental Organization, and the community in achieving common goals in controlling TB.

For example, governments can leverage the reach of Non Governmental Organization and communities to reach key populations, while Non Governmental Organization need legitimacy from governments to gain support. In the context of the Health Service, the results of interviews show that the party has been actively working by involving various organizations, but there is hope to involve academics more in TB research and encourage the private sector to commit to TB control efforts. In this way, building shared understanding is not only the foundation for successful collaboration but also encourages inclusivity and cross-sector commitment in handling common health problems.

The reason for involving academics in the collaboration process is that they are expected to be one of the actors who play a role in socializing TB in the academic field, especially in schools, as part of providing learning about the urgency of TB to students. Then the involvement of the private sector is also needed. In this collaboration, Non Governmental Organization working together with the government are expected to remain stable and responsible for the fields they work on, which is one of the main keys to the success of TB control in the Riau Islands Province.

Intermediate Outcomes

Collaboration will occur when the goals and benefits of collaboration are concrete and when the possibility of victory from the collaboration is small. This is a temporary result of an ongoing process that provides benefits and strategic value ([Tri Sambodo & Pribadi, 2016](#)). Demonstrated by the progress of TB cases that have been successfully handled by stakeholders, this is proof that we need to continue this collaboration. The interim results obtained in carrying out the collaboration, based on the results of interviews, stated that there was a reduction in TB cases in the Riau Islands Province, but it was not significant.

Due to the fact that the new collaboration time will be running well in August 2023, it will be very short to make preparations such as strategies, regional apparatus organizations and memoranda of understanding with stakeholders. Based on the target to be achieved for TB in the Riau Islands Province, the results are:

1. Treatment and coverage, which only reached 45 percent and did not reach the required target. Although this figure increased by 20 percent compared to the previous year,
2. The success rate, said to be good because it reached 82 percent. Then,
3. TB enrollment, which in treatment has reached 90 percent.

This proves that the temporary results obtained from the results of the collaboration carried out with stakeholders have gone well, but if you look at the targets which are still not perfect, updates need to be made to achieve the targets. The informant said that TB is like an iceberg; currently

stakeholders are aggressively trying to find gaps in cases that have not been detected, so the process currently being undertaken is not reducing cases; instead it is how cases that have not been found in the community can be detected so that the impact is elimination.

Factors Inhibiting Collaborative Governance in Overcoming Tuberculosis Cases in the Riau Islands Province

In carrying out the collaboration process, of course there are obstacles faced by stakeholders. Based on the results of interviews with informants, the obstacles faced were:

- a) In carrying out collaboration, not all regional apparatus organizations involved can collaborate directly with each other.
- b) Collaboration requires commitment; to make actors commit, some kind of sanction is needed. However, because stakeholders have equal functions, the role of top leaders is to collaborate.
- c) There are TB activities that must be carried out, but the Regency/City of Riau Islands Province still does not have awareness of the minimum service standards that need to be achieved.
- d) Late and unreported TB cases discovered at SITB
- e) From the community side, it is a form of budget; overcoming TB requires investment. Currently, the community is still funded by foreign funding. If this funding no longer exists, it will be borne by the state.

CONCLUSION

The existence of a collaboration process is proven by the Acceleration Team for Controlling TB according to the Governor's Decree of 2022, and the Riau Islands Province already has a collaboration team to deal with TB cases. Collaboration is carried out by the Riau Islands Provincial Health Service as the lead sector or implementing element together with the private sector and the community.

This is motivated by the fact that data on the number of TB cases based on SITB is still increasing, and cases are still found that have not been reported by health service facilities to SITB. From the results of the research conducted, it can be concluded that in dealing with TB cases in the Riau Islands Province, the Regional Government of the Riau Islands Province collaborated with stakeholders have succeeded. The indicators used in this research are face to face, trust building, commitment to process, share understanding, intermediated outcomes.

The stackholder held customary formal or casual direct gatherings which were held by the requirements of the point at the time expected to talk about case disclosure systems, difficulties and extraordinary open doors, obstructions and follow-up plans for carrying out the program. The trust and commitment to the tasks that have been assigned in accordance with the applicable decree are then built through a process. Interim results show that the expected target has good results, although not significant, due to the lack of achieving the desired program target. Changes or revisions related to collaboration are needed because of the obstacles faced by stakeholders. From what the author has explained, the recommendation needed is to strengthen solidarity between stakeholders involved to accelerate TB prevention for a better collaboration process.

Then, there is a need for completeness in terms of infrastructure structure to accelerate the discovery of TB cases in the Riau Islands Province.

REFERENCE

- Abdussamad, Z. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (P. Rapanna, Ed.; Cetakan I). CV. syakir Media Press.
- Angger. (2015, May 6). *Perkembangan Pelayanan Publik dalam Rangka Mewujudkan Pelayanan Prima*. Bkd.JogjaproV.Go.Id.
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- Anwar, N. H. (2014). Urban transformations: Brokers, collaborative governance and community building in Karachis periphery. *South Asian History and Culture*, 5(1), 75–92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19472498.2013.863011>
- Arai, Y., Oktoriana, S., Suharyani, A., & Inoue, M. (2021). How can we mitigate power imbalances in collaborative environmental governance? Examining the role of the village facilitation team approach observed in west Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 13(7). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13073972>
- Arifin, S., & Dewi, U. (2018). COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM PROGRAM RINTISAN DESA INKLUSIF DI DESA SENDANGADI KECAMATAN MLATI KABUPATEN SLEMAN. *Journal of Public Policy and Administration Research*, 315–322. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21831/joppar.v3i3.12672>
- Bae, Y., Joo, Y.-M., & Won, S.-Y. (2016). Decentralization and collaborative disaster governance: Evidence from South Korea. *Habitat International*, 52, 50–56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.habitatint.2015.08.027>
- Brown, P., Von Daniels, C., Bocken, N. M. P., & Balkenende, A. R. (2021). A process model for collaboration in circular oriented innovation. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 286. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.125499>
- Dinas Kesehatan Provinsi Kepulauan Riau. (2023). *Laporan Implementasi PPM Kepulauan Riau*.
- Eka, N., Setiawandari, P., Kriswibowo Prodi, A., Publik, A., Veteran, U., Timur, J., & Koresponden, S. *. (2023). COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM PENGELOLAAN SAMPAH COLLABORATION GOVERNANCE IN WASTE MANAGEMENT. In *Jurnal Kebijakan Publik* (Vol. 14, Issue 2). <https://jkp.ejournal.unri.ac.idhttps://jkp.ejournal.unri.ac.id>
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 22(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>

- Gestel, N. V., & Grotenbreg, S. (2021). Collaborative governance and innovation in public services settings. *Policy and Politics*, 49(2), 249–265. <https://doi.org/10.1332/030557321X16123785900606>
- Greenway, J. (2021). Place-based collaborative governance: The potential influence of governments. *Geographical Research*, 59(3), 349–361. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1745-5871.12475>
- Khasanah, R. P., Purnomo, E. P., & Kasiwi, A. N. (2021). Collaborative Governance In National Community Empowerment Programs In Poverty Alleviat. *JPPUMA Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan Dan Sosial Politik Universitas Medan Area*, 9(1), 29–35. <https://doi.org/10.31289/jppuma.v9i1.3755>
- Kim, S. (2016). The workings of collaborative governance: Evaluating collaborative community-building initiatives in Korea. *Urban Studies*, 53(16), 3547–3565. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098015613235>
- Lorwena, K. (2021). STANDAR PELAYANAN PUSAT KESEHATAN MASYARAKAT. *FOKUS : PUBLIKASI ILMIAH UNTUK MAHASISWA, STAF PENGAJAR DAN ALUMNI UNIVERSITAS KAPUAS SINTANG, Vol. 21 No. 1 (2023): FOKUS : Publikasi Ilmiah untuk Mahasiswa, Staf Pengajar dan Alumni Universitas Kapuas Sintang*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.51826/fokus.v21i1.721>
- Made Dwi Arisanti, N., & Wayan Suderana, I. (2020). Penanganan Pandemi Covid-19: Kolaborasi Pemerintah Kabupaten Bersama KNPI Gianyar Di Kabupaten Gianyar, Bali. *Spirit Publik*, 15(2), 87–96. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.20961/sp.v15i2.43097>
- Martomo, Y. P. (2017). *COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE SEBAGAI BASIS PENGELOLAAN PUBLIC AFFAIRS* (F. Wartoyo, Ed.; Cetakan Pertama). YUMA PRESSINDO.
- Menberu, M., Kar, S., & Ranjan Behera, M. (2022). Review on public private mix TB control strategy in India. *Indian Journal of Tuberculosis*, 69(3), 277–281. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijtb.2021.07.007>
- Moleong, L. J. . (2010). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mustiasih, T. (2022). Collaborative Governance Dalam Pencegahan Penyebaran Tuberkulosis Paru Di Rumah Sakit Paru Provinsi Jawa Barat. *AMMA : Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat*, 1, 876–882. <https://journal.mediapublikasi.id/index.php/amma>
- Nurharjadm, W., & Nurhayati, I. (2022). Collaborative Governance dalam Implementasi Perda tentang Pengawasan, Pengendalian Peredaran dan Penjualan Minuman Beralkohol di Kabupaten Sukoharjo. *Spirit Publik*, 17, 25–30. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.20961/sp.v17i1.63566>
- Pemerintah Provinsi Kepulauan Riau. (2023). *Data Monitoring and Evaluation Tuberkulosis 2023*.
- Probandari, A., Harbianto, D., Meyant, F., Houben, R., Rudman, J., Fiekert, K., Ahmadova, S. R., & Jatilaksono, S. (2020). *Strategi Nasional Penanggulangan Tuberkulosis di Indonesia 2020-2024*.

- Rita Fiantika, F., Wasil, M., Jumiyati, S., Honesti, L., & Wahyuni, S. (2022). *METODOLOGI PENELITIAN KUALITATIF* (Y. Novita, Ed.; 1st ed.). PT. GLOBAL EKSEKUTIF TEKNOLOGI. www.globaleksekutifteknologi.co.id
- Rosidi, A., & Anggraeni. (2013). *Reveinting Local Government, Demokrasi, dan Reformasi Pelayanan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Cv. Andi Offset.
- Sønderskov, M. (2019). Do local politicians really want collaborative governance? *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 32(3), 320–330. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJPSM-10-2017-0271>
- Stephenson, L., & Byard, R. W. (2019). Issues in the handling of cases of tuberculosis in the mortuary. *Journal of Forensic and Legal Medicine*, 64, 42–44. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jflm.2019.04.002>
- Sudarmo. (2011). *Isu-isu administrasi publik dalam prespektif governance*. Smart Media.
- Tri Sambodo, G., & Pribadi, U. (2016). Pelaksanaan Collaborative Governance di Desa Budaya Brosot, Galur, Kulonprogo, DI. Yogyakarta. *Journal of Governance and Public Policy*, 3(1), 1–30. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jgpp.2016.0052>
- World Health Organization. (2022). *Global Tuberculosis report 2022*. <http://apps.who.int/bookorders>.